Project 3: Literature Review

Melinda Nelson, TUL 670A
Azusa Pacific University,
Spring 2015, Dr. Viv Grigg

Project 3: Literature Review

"We have some independent research centres, unconnected with the University; we have civil society organizations of various sorts, but in terms of academia and universities, there is very little."   Mozambican Economist João Mosca

Introduction

Contextually, it must be understood that documentation (adequate data and research) of variable issues in Mozambique are grievously lacking. This no doubt relates to a history of civil war, impoverishment, disease and other life-threatening conditions that have served to keep a focus on survival needs, rather then education, development and research. Mozambique is entering a new era of development due to 1) a relatively stable political situation since the war, 2) recent discoveries of oil, gas and mineral deposits, and 3) the increasing interests of foreign governments and NGO's (Smith, 2012).   As a result of this changing reality, there is a growing body of national research being deposited in libraries and government offices, but the overall condition is still deficient and dearth (Heerde, Hemphill, Broderick & Florent, 2012; Meyers, 2008).

This dismal state of affairs was documented by the Open Society Initiative for Southern Africa (OSISA) in 2011 when they conducted their own research study in Mozambique. OSISA reported, "There is a serious lack of accurate and coherent data on youth and adult education in Mozambique. …the Education for All report (World Education Forum, 2000) noted that: 'the lack of an adequate statistic data collection system of the sector contributes to the lack of qualitative information regarding on Adult Education and Literacy'"(Luis, 2012, p 24).

Though the above example focuses on education, it reflects a reality that all researchers in Mozambique face. One cannot dismiss the relevance of a 16 year long civil war (1976-1992) in which 50% of the nations educational institutions were destroyed. The significance of this is visible on the national flag, where an AK-47 weapon is prominently displayed (Jacob and Benzkofer, 2015).)

Thus, it is not surprising that my literature review needs to travel outside the boundaries of Mozambique. Though I have been able to find some scholarly articles confined to this region, there are not enough of them dealing with my focus in research, so I have included academic articles from other regions of the continent.

And because I am exploring the issue of transitional care of AO orphans, I have also examined research on this subject from other areas of the world as well. For the most part I have stuck to research related to developing world nations as many of the challenges Mozambicans aging out of their institutions face relate to that construct.

That being noted, it doesn't mean I overlooked *all* developed world research. In order to explore what categories there might be potential overlap in, I did examine some scholarly studies from Scotland, America, Ireland and a few other developed nations.

The focus of my literature review is being bracketed to capture five predominant categories that appear to have significant relevance to my research focus. The relationships between these concepts and my primary research question is strong, and examining them helps fill in some gaps regarding why the AO orphan population faces the challenges it does. It is a holistic approach, and moves from an initial broad canvas looking at God and spirituality, to a narrower focus of the individual.

The data collection method that proves to be most predominant in researching this population are qualitative one-to-one semi-structured interviews and focus groups. I previously considered using focus groups, as they certainly would have reduced the time of one-to-one interviews, but the more I studied the purpose of focus groups, the more convinced I became that they didn't naturally lend themselves to my particular research. I don't doubt they would yield some useful data, but I think the individual interviews allow a person to feel more at ease and less endangered by expressing an opinion that might run contrary to other's in the group.

Some researchers have relied on secondary data sources for the bulk of their data, but I do not believe that is an appropriate path for me to follow as I feel the primary research gap in this nation needs to be reduced. I hope my small contribution is a step in the right direction. I don't have illusions that it will be significant enough in scope to stimulate great advances, but I do pray it creates a hunger for further enquiry, and that ultimately my primary focus of aged out orphans will see positive changes coming into their midst.

The Wide Lens

Starting with a broad perspective then, I examined some of the overlap that exists between the aging out population and impoverishment. As mentioned in my chapter one Introduction, poverty is widespread in Mozambique, so there is no surprise in finding a great majority of aging out orphans in the ranks of the extremely poor. When thinking about the poor, Corbett and Fikkert (2009) wisely advise we remember:

> *"Like all human beings, poor people have a range of physical, emotional, social, and spiritual needs. Hence, appropriate interventions, for poor people include such diverse sectors as economic development, health, education, agriculture, spiritual formation, etc."*

Thus, one of the first places to start in examining AO orphan viability outside orphanage walls, is to look at the influence one's spiritual health has on the opportunity to flourish and thrive.

1. Spiritual Health

 The transition from adolescence to adulthood is considered one of the most challenging periods of human development. For orphans experiencing the transition from a supportive institutional environment to an isolating independent environment, the shock can be even greater.

One way the transitional period is navigated with greater ease by some is when the AO orphan has a relationship with God and feels spiritually supported. Otherwise, they experience abandonment all over again. For those who have been brought up in Christian orphan care facilities, they may find their faith wavering when they no longer have the 'props' that have allowed them to engage in 'worship' and 'fellowship' without any effort on their own part.

Some AO orphans flounder in their faith when leaving their institution, just like some American teenagers do when they leave home for college. There is not much literature documenting the positive and negative effects Christian care facilities might be responsible for in the lives of orphans leaving their institutions in Mozambique. (I hope my findings can 'fill the gap' and contribute to building that baseline up.)

2. Employment Opportunities

Africa has the youngest population in the world, with some 200 million people between the ages of 15- and 24-years-old. This number is estimated to double by 2045. The trend offers a reservoir of young human capital that can be channeled toward the productive sectors of the continent's economy. However, African countries have yet to create sufficient employment opportunities for this group.

Young people make up 60 percent of Africa's unemployed, and youth unemployment rates are double those of adult unemployment in most African countries. The International Labor Organization (ILO) estimates that there were 73 million jobs created in Africa between 2000 and 2008 but that only 16 million were for people between 15 and 24-years-old. As a result, many young Africans find themselves unemployed or underemployed in informal, low productivity jobs, with few opportunities for further development.

Young Africa, a phenomenal program that includes reaching out to aging out orphans, to date, has seen 26,000 youth graduate from their facilities in Zimbabwe and Mozambique. About 83 percent of the graduates in Mozambique have managed to secure employment either in the formal sector or through self-employment.

3. Educational Opportunities

Success in higher education has been correlated with greater earning potential, improved self-worth, and confidence (Casey, 2008). Too often when an orphan has to

leave their CCI, their education has to cease as well.

Institutional living itself seems to contribute to decreased outputs. Studies in the USA have suggested young people in institutional care lag at least half a school year behind demographically to similar students (Smithgall et al, 2004: 14).

Due to the extensive oil, gas and mineral deposits discovered in this nation in the last ten years, there has been a whirlwind of development activity, and an influx of trained foreigners taking jobs that could have gone to Mozambicans if they were better educated.

4. Family/Social/Community Health

According to the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, "The family is the fundamental group of society and the natural environment for the growth, well-being and protection of children, but for those who are orphans, challenges emerge in becoming healthy productive members of a community who flourish and thrive, rather than wither and die" (1989).

Every young person deserves to live in a supportive protective nurturing and caring environment that promotes their full potential, but for AO orphans, many are being denied this as they are kicked out or sent out from their orphanages. Data from Eastern Europe, reveals less than 50% of the orphan population will live to see their 20th birthday (Bond, 2012). But the data is scarce for Africa in general, and Mozambique in particular.

Literature reviews reveal that the best practice approach should primarily be directed towards enabling the child to remain in or return to the care of close family members when parental care is unavailable due to death, disease, or abandonment (Williamson & Greenberg, 2010). Community-based care options are preferable to institutions. Sometimes though, when family and community options have been tapped, institutional care steps in to meet the needs of this vulnerable population. Christian care institutions are especially common. Unfortunately, with many CCI's, there is a lack of vision or intention in regards to equipping these vulnerable young people for life outside their walls.

When thinking of what the solutions to this crisis might be, it becomes clear that to simply think of orphans in isolation will not solve the challenges. Celestin Musekura, CEO and founder of African Leadership and Reconciliation Ministry claims "Christians should not be talking about helping anyone," he said. "We should be talking about mutually giving to each other so we can grow." This is a community-based care perspective, and is worth pursuing in the field of AO orphan care.

In reviewing the literature, it becomes apparent that what is needed are efforts that incorporate churches, NGO's, businesses, government agencies, educators and community members. Only then can we develop the whole community, which is truly the best solution for AO orphans, *and* the community.

Young Africa is one such example that actually does successfully network with churches, NGO's, businesses, government agencies, educators and community members (Beurskens et al.., 2013)! Their holistic integrated approach to development proves itself more effective than singularly-focused efforts, and YA's work with aging out orphans, in particular, is very successful in an arena that is too often marked with failure. YA founder Beurskens explains, "It is the whole package that allows the young person to stand stronger in his/her own shoes.

5. Personal/Psychosocial
"We needed love like we needed bread" (Bell, 2014).

For aging out orphans, internal, rather than external constraints may be the binding factor. When AO orphans define their impoverished condition, they do so primarily in psychological and social terms. They talk about "shame, inferiority, powerlessness, humiliation, fear, hopelessness, depression, social isolation and voicelessness (Corbett & Fikkert, 2009). What matters is not just facts, but people's *perceptions* of these facts (2009).

According to the American Academy of Pediatrics, compared with children from the same socioeconomic background, children in care have much higher rates of serious emotional and behavioral problems, chronic physical disabilities, birth defects, and developmental delays (2007). Thus, by the time an orphan 'graduates' from their institution, they may be doing so with a flunking grade in 'Community Viability.'

And once the orphan enters that transitional space between institutional and independent living, studies from my literature review reveal that they face ongoing challenges that force them to mature more quickly than their other peers (Mmusi, 2014).   And because of how abrupt that transition time is, AO orphans are often denied the psychological opportunity to deal with those changes over time — which is how most young people are able to deal with problems and challenges (Stein, 2005). As a result, many young people leaving care have very poor life chances compared to their peers.

The best outcomes appear to come from continuum of care efforts that allow AO orphans to transition from dependence to independence in a gradual and flexible rate, rather than an accelerated one (Geenan & Powers, 2007, p 1086). Care leavers (another term for aging out) cannot reasonably be expected to attain instant adulthood without family or community assistance . Virtually no one can handle suddenly having to successfully attain independent housing, leave school, move into further education, training or employment, and in some cases become a parent, all at the same time.

These are the sorts of tasks that most youth can undertake sequentially, but AO orphans aren't given that luxury. Regardless, each individual has unique and different requirements for transitioning from dependence to independence.

Once again, Young Africa addresses the need of the individual at this level as well. "We run a life skills training program, which is mainstreamed into the curriculum and includes lessons in personal empowerment, [e.g.] how to stand up for civic and human rights, build self-confidence, and develop leadership skills" says Beurskens (2013). She believes their skills of heart and mind' training helps nurture the social and emotional skills of these individuals, and ultimately produces young and successful changemakers (2013).

Conclusion

The top textual sources I utilized, are as follows:

Frimpong-Manso, Kwabena. (2015). The social support networks of care leavers from a children's village in Ghana: formal and informal supports. *Child & Family Social Work*. doi: 10.1111/cfs.12218

Geenen, S, & Powers, L E. (2007). "Tomorrow is another problem" The experiences of youth in foster care during their transition into adulthood. *Children and Youth Services Review, 29*, 1085-1101.

Gonzalez, S. (2014). *From foster care to adulthood: success stories* (2014), University of Pennsylvania, PA.

Hiles, D, Moss, D, John, & Dallos, R.. (2013). Young people's experience of social support during the process of leaving care: A review of the literature. *Elsevier, 35*, 2059-2071.

Johnston, E. B. (2015). *Orphans' Hope: An Evaluation of Residential Orphan Care in Malawi Africa.* (Honors), Emily B. Johnston, Lakeland, FL.

Mmusi, F. I. (2014). *Description and assessment of care leavers application of social skills into independent living.*(Masters), University of Johannesburg.

Tanur, C. (2012/10/1). Project Lungisela: supporting young people leaving state care in South Africa. *Child Care in Practice, 18*(4), 325-340.

Vissera, Maretha, Zungub, Nompumelelo, & Ndala-Magoroa, Nkateko. (2015). ISIBINDI, creating circles of care for orphans and vulnerable children in South Africa: post-programme outcomes. *AIDS Care: Psychological and Socio-medical Aspects of AIDS/HIV, 27*(8), 1014-1019.

This chapter has briefly surveyed literature on the relationships between aging out orphans and five subsets of life that effect this transition, being mindful of the implications this has for Christian childcare providers. I have noted progressions from cosmic spiritual issues to social/community care issues to employment and educational concerns, all the way to individual identity issues.

The literature review favors holistic approaches to AO orphan transitions that involve adult support and gradual movement. The challenges are many, including financial instability, poor educational/vocational opportunities and outcomes, lack of safe and affordable housing and missing life skills (Medicine) & Council), 2013). Results of one aging out study suggested that successes among this population were hardwon and tenuous (Gonzalez, 2014) .

Though some like to favor 'resilience' as a central organizing concept, a review of the literature on self-esteem, single-issue movements, although popular, usually oversimplify complex associations (Elmer, 2001). Resilience theory as it relates to this subject of study is somewhat controversial. Some say it places the blame on those who already have been marginalized, and that it is not only too simplistic to explain a complex phenomenon, but it is harmful to those it seeks to help (Chadburn, 2015)..

The problems AO orphans face are multi-faceted, and Christian orphan care institutions would do well to approach the topic with the respect, attention and understanding it deserves. Too often, considering the plight of an orphan's transitional journey from institutional living to independence is approached as an afterthought. But the literature review reveals that to take such an approach would be a grave oversight, and is undertaken at the peril of the OVY's actual survival. Suicide rates of AO orphans are a disgrace to humanity, and especially those institutions designed to help them in the first place.

As orphan care advocate Tom Davis said to his board and staff members, and I opened up this paper with, our vision is marred if we drop the ball on orphan care when they reach the age of 17 or 18 years old and abandon them to choices of prostitution and crime. One published paper likened the experience to having a football team go to a championship game and play the first half brilliantly, but then fail to come out during the 2nd half which actually determines the outcome of the game (Bedford, p 9, 2012)!

What has also become clear in looking though these other published reports is that there is clearly a need for additional research to produce more verifiable data and understanding. There is a particular gap in connecting the effects of the variable relationships between Christian orphan caregivers and AO orphans, especially in Mozambique.

Bibliography

Africa: Despite Africa's Achievements, Poverty Unacceptable-IMF,(2014, May 29).
    http://allafrica.com/stories/201405291711.html?aa_source=acrdn-f0

American Academy of Pediatrics (2007). Testimony of David Rubin, M.D., MSCE,
    FAAP, on behalf of the American Academy of Pediatrics. House Ways and
    Means Subcommittee on Income Security and Family Support Hearing, *Foster
    Care and the Health Care System.* Retrieved from http://www.aap.org/en-
    us/advocacy-and-policy/federal-advocacy/Documents/
    FosterChildrenandtheHealthCareSystem.pdf.

Bedford, H. (2012, Autumn). Towards better outcomes: A Social Investment Model of
    Support for young people transitioning from out-of-home care. *Developing
    Practice* (32), 110.

Bell, K (2014). Resisting commensurability: Against informed consent as an
    anthropological virtue. *American Anthropologist*, 116(3): 1-21.
    http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/aman.12122/abstract

Beurskens, D, Joseph, R. A., Varela, A, Mukurazita, E, Campen, G, Beurskens, M, . . .
    Bellens, D. (2013). Young Africa Annual Report 2012. In D. Beurskens (Ed.), (pp.
    47). Dondo, Mozambique: Young Africa.

Bond, L. (2012). Aged-Out Orphan Ministry. from www.engraved.org/our-
    ministry/aged-out/

Breman, M. (2013, July 16). Youth Empowerment is Key to President Obama's Vision
    for Africa's Future. Retrieved from http://blog.usaid.gov/2013/07/youth-
    empowerment-is-key-to-president-obamas-vision-for-africas-future/

Casey, J. (2012). Promoting Development of Resilience among Young People in Foster
    Care. Retrieved from
    http://www.mainecourtimprovement.org/fileLibrary/file_53.pdf >

Chadburn, M. (2015). Resilience Is Futile: How Well-Meaning Nonprofits Perpetuate
    Poverty. from http://jezebel.com/resilience-is-futile-how-well-meaning-
    nonprofits-perpe-1716461384

Corbett, S, & Fikkert, B. (2009). *When Helping Hurts*. Chicago, IL: Moody Publishers.

Creswell, J. (2014). Chapter three: The use of theory. *Research design: Qualitative,
    quantitative, and mixed methods approaches*. London: Sage Publications Ltd.

Dawson, C.(2015). Participant Observation.
    2015,http://www.lifelearner.net/?page_id=674

Desai, V. and Potter, R. (Eds.) (2012). *Doing development research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Elmer, N. (2001) Self-esteem: The Costs and Causes of Low Self-worth. York: York Publishing Services/Joseph Rowntree Foundation

Few Jobs despite Booming Mozambique Economy, (2015, Jan 12). *Sudan Vision*. Retrieved from http://world.einnews.com/article/244007986/-1RTKksDbhv1E69L

Frimpong-Manso, Kwabena. (2015). The social support networks of care leavers from a children's village in Ghana: formal and informal supports. *Child & Family Social Work*. doi: 10.1111/cfs.12218

Geenen, S, & Powers, L E. (2007). "Tomorrow is another problem" The experiences of youth in foster care during their transition into adulthood. *Children and Youth Services Review, 29*, 1085-1101.

Gonzalez, S. (2014). *From foster care to adulthood: success stories* (2014), University of Pennsylvania, PA.

Gray, D. E. (2014). *Doing research in the real world* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Greer, P., & Smith, P. (2009). *The Poor Will Be Glad*. Grand Rapids, Michigan Zondervan.

Grigg, V. (2009). Transformational Conversations: Hermeneutic for a Postmodern City. *The Spirit of Christ and the Postmodern City: Transformative Revival Among Auckland's Evangelicals and Pentecostals*. Lexington, KY, Asbury: Emeth Press and Auckland: Urban Leadership Foundation.

Gross, J. (2013). *From orphans to scholars: Narratives of educational mobility of Khmer international students.* (Ph.D. Dissertations & Theses), Azusa Pacific University, Ann Arbor, MI. (3607065)

Guilengue, F. (2014, Nov 6). Victory to the losers: Mozambique's 2014 elections. *Pambazuka News*.

Heerde, J. A., Hemphill, S. A., Broderick, D, & Florent, A. (2012, Autumn). Associations between leaving out-ofhome care and post-transition youth homelessness: A review. *Developing Practice, 32*, 37-52.

Hiles, D, Moss, D, John, & Dallos, R.. (2013). Young people's experience of social support during the process of leaving care: A review of the literature. *Elsevier,*

35, 2059-2071.

Hope International. (2013). Humanitarian Aid Programs. from
        http://www.hopeadoption.org/humanitarian-aid/humanitarian-aid-programs.html

International Center for Research on Women (ICRW). (2010). *Child Marriage Facts and
        Figures*. Washington D.C.: International Center for Research on Women (ICRW)
        Retrieved from http://www.icrw.org/child-marriage-facts-and-figures.

International Youth Foundation. YouthMap Mozambique: Voices of the Next
        Generation—An Assessment of Youth in Mozambique: International Youth
        Foundation.

Jacob, M & Benzkofer, S. (2015). 10 things you might not know about flags, *Chicago
        Tribune*. Retrieved from
        http://www.chicagotribune.com/news/opinion/commentary/ct-flags-iwo-jima-
        civil-war-confederate-perspec-0719-jm-20150716-story.html

Johnston, E. B. (2015). *Orphans' Hope: An Evaluation of Residential Orphan Care in
        Malawi Africa.* (Honors), Emily B. Johnston, Lakeland, FL.

Luis, R. (2012). Youth and adult learning and education in Mozambique. *Open Society
        Initiative for Southern Africa.* Retrieved from:
        http://www.osisa.org/sites/default/files/mozambique_yale_final.pdf

Morakinyo, A. 2011. Why it is important to make education affordable. *You think!*
        Washington, D.C.: World Bank, 20 May 2011.
        http://youthink.worldbank.org/issues/education/why-it-important-make-
        education-affordable

Mozambique Ministry of Education (MINED). (2014). *Minister of Education Highlights
        Progress Notable in 2013*. Maputo, Mozambique: MINED Retrieved from
        http://www.mined.gov.mz/Pages/Comentarios.aspx?listName=NoticiasMined&e
        wsId=87.

Mmusi, F. I. (2014). *Description and assessment of care leavers application of social
        skills into independent living.* (Masters), University of Johannesburg,
        Johannesburg, South Africa. Retrieved from
        http://ujdigispace.uj.ac.za/handle/10210/10375

Meyers, I. J. (2008). The Experience of a Late Adolescent State Care Leaver: A
        Phenomenological Study. M. A. Dissertation, University of Johannesburg.

Myers, B. Ed. (2011). *Working with the poor: New insights and learnings from
        development practitioners*. Orbis Books.

Plan International Mozambique. (2015, July 10). Youth views on development: Youth economic empowerment in Mozambique. *European Year for Development.* from https://europa.eu/eyd2015/en/plan-international/posts/youth-views-plan-international-mozambique

Posnett, M. (2013). Alongsiders Impact Assessment (pp. 1-36): Alongsiders International.

Ryan, G & Bernard, H. R. (2003). Techniques to Identify Themes. *Field Methods, 15*(1), P 85-109 doi: 10.1177/1525822X02239569

Slimbach, R. (2014). Real World Research. *The Art of Fieldwork* (pp. 1-56). Azusa: Azusa Pacific University.

Smith, D. (2012). Boom time for Mozambique, once the basket case of Africa, *The guardian*. Retrieved from http://www.theguardian.com/world/2012/mar/27/mozambique-africa-energy-resources-bonanza?CMP=share_btn_fb

Social Research Association (SRA). (2002). Ethical Guidelines 2002. from http://the-sra.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/SRA-Ethics-guidelines-2002.pdf

Stein, M. (2005). *Resilience and young people leaving care*. White Rose University Consortium, University of York.

Stein, M. (2006). Young people aging out of care: The poverty of theory. *Children and Youth Services Review, 28*, 422– 434.

Tanur, C. (2012/10/1). Project Lungisela: supporting young people leaving   state care in South Africa. *Child Care in Practice, 18*(4), 325-340.

Thomson, G. (2012). The Growing Participator Approach (GPA): A Brief State of the Art and Some Practical Illustrations.

UNICEF. (2013). *Basic Education Quality*. Retrieved from http://www.unicef.org/mozambique/education.html.

UNICEF. (2014). Annual Report 2013: Mozambique (pp. 52). Maputo, Mozambique: UNICEF.

United Nations, (1989). Convention on the Rights of the Child. New York, NY: Office of the High Commisioner for Human Rights.

United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA). (2011). The State of World Population 2011. In R. Kollodge (Ed.). New York, NY.

Vanier, J. (1988). *The Broken Body*. (p. 78-9).Darton, Longman & Todd Ltd.

Vissera, M., Zungub, N., & Ndala-Magoroa, N. (2015). ISIBINDI, creating circles of care for orphans and vulnerable children in South Africa: post-programme outcomes. *AIDS Care: Psychological and Socio-medical Aspects of AIDS/HIV, 27*(8), 1014-1019.

Williamson, J, & Greenberg, A. (2010). Families, Not Orphanages *Better Care Network Working Paper* (pp. 1-26): USAID,UNICEF.

Willis, K. (2006). Interviewing. In *Doing Development Research* (pp. 144-152). Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

World Bank. (2015). World Development Indicators 2015. In World Bank (Ed.). Washington, DC: World Bank.

World Food Programme. (2010). Mozambique Comprehensive Food Security and Vulnerability Analysis - September 2010. Maputo, Mozambique: United Nations World Food Programme.